

3.1. Current Appeals and Results - October 2020

AUTHOR: Craig Winn, Solicitor

ENDORSED BY: Ken Gouldthorp, General Manager

ATTACHMENTS:

1. Current Appeal Matters List LEC [**3.1.1** - 5 pages]
2. Local Court Matters List [**3.1.2** - 2 pages]
3. NCAT Matters List [**3.1.3** - 1 page]

PURPOSE:

Report on current appeal and prosecution matters.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY:

Attached is a list of current appeal and prosecution matters as at 30 September 2020 for Council's information.

FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS:

As at 30 September 2020, Council has incurred \$311,683 on legal fees for the 2020/2021 financial year and recovered legal costs in the amount of \$79,971. The legal budget for 2021 financial year is \$ 1,500,000.00.

RECOMMENDATION:

1. **THAT** the Current Appeals and Results – October 2020 report be received.

LINK TO COMMUNITY STRATEGIC PLAN

The relationship with the Community Strategic Plan is as follows:

5. Our Civic Leadership

5.2 Council is well governed and customer focused

BACKGROUND

The Current Appeals and Prosecutions list was last reported to the Legal and Planning Committee meeting of 15 June 2020.

CONSULTATION REQUIREMENTS

Community engagement is not required.

DETAIL

The defence of Land and Environment Court appeals and the prosecution of regulatory matters represents a major ongoing expense for Council. The attached list provides a summary of each current appeal(s) and prosecution(s) (including fees incurred) as at 30 September 2020.

**CURRENT MATTERS LIST – LAND & ENVIRONMENT COURT
As at 30 September 2020**

Property DA No. Appeal No. Date of Appeal (DOA)	Applicant/ Other party	Nature of Appeal	Council Officer responsible	Status	Fees Estimate (\$) Fees Billed (\$) Disb. (\$) Officer Recommendation Council decision	Result
12 Raymond Road, Neutral Bay DA 266/17 LEC 358115/18 DOA 22/11/18 SH	William and Olivia Northcott	Class 4 Summons seeking judicial review of certain conditions imposed in determining DA 266/17.	Hugh Shouldice	Appeal dismissed with costs awarded to Council. Agreed costs of \$60,000 paid by Applicant. Matter closed.	Fee Estimate: \$105,000 Fees: \$105,968.75 Recommendation: Approved Decision: Approved	Appeal dismissed Costs awarded to Council Matter closed
55-61 Chandos Street, St Leonards DA 32/19 LEC 100913/19 DOA 05/04/19 MDK	Tasktea Pty Ltd	Class 1 Appeal against the deemed refusal of alterations and additions with including new shop top housing.	Lara Huckstepp	Council served with Class 1 Appeal with matter listed for hearing on 20-24 July 2020. Appeal upheld on 17 August 2020. Matter closed.	Fee Estimate: \$40,000 Fees: \$74,216.61 Recommendation: N/A Decision: N/A	Appeal upheld Matter closed
67-69 Chandos Street, St Leonards DA 30/19 LEC 125653/19 DOA 24/04/19 MDK	TWT Development Pty Ltd	Class 1 Appeal against the deemed refusal of the demolition existing structures and the construction of an 11 storey mixed use building containing 22 apartments with parking.	George Youhanna	Council served with Class 1 Appeal with matter listed for hearing on 20-24 July 2020. Appeal upheld on 11 August 2020. Matter closed.	Fee Estimate: \$40,000 Fees: \$87,255.98 Recommendation: N/A Decision: N/A	Appeal upheld Matter closed
22-26 Spruson St, Neutral Bay DA 65/19 LEC 229229/19 DOA 31/07/19 HWL	Made Property Group Pty Limited	Class 1 appeal against the deemed refusal of the demolition of existing buildings and construction of a residential flat building.	Luke Donovan	Appeal dismissed. Costs of \$10,000 awarded in Council's favour. Matter closed.	Fee Estimate: \$71,000 Fees: \$97,328.48 Recommendation: N/A Decision: N/A	Appeal dismissed Matter closed
3 Parker St, McMahons Point DA 103/19 LEC 260634/19 DOA 27/08/19 H&W	Brazete Investments Pty Ltd	Class 1 appeal against the deemed refusal for the adaptive reuse and alterations and additions to create a three level residential flat building.	George Youhanna	Council served with Class 1 Appeal with matter listed for a s34 hearing on 25 February 2020. Section 34 hearing terminated. Listed for hearing on 19 and 20 October 2020.	Fee Estimate: \$15,000 Fees: \$9,089.06 Recommendation: N/A Decision: N/A	Pending Listing for hearing on 19 and 20 October 2020

Property DA No. Appeal No. Date of Appeal (DOA)	Applicant/ Other party	Nature of Appeal	Council Officer responsible	Status	Fees Estimate (\$) Fees Billed (\$) Disb. (\$) Officer Recommendation Council decision	Result
5 Bay View St, Lavender Bay DA 55/19 LEC 268493/19 DOA 3/09/19 HWL	Yolenda Camuglia	Class 1 appeal against the deemed refusal for the demolition of existing structures, retainment of the swimming pool and the construction of a new residential flat building.	Kim Rothe	Appeal upheld on 21 September 2020. Matter closed.	Fee Estimate: \$45,000 Fees: \$48,706.59 Recommendation: N/A Decision: N/A	Appeal upheld Matter closed
21 Christie Street, Wollstonecraft DA 238/19 LEC 298474/19 DOA 30/09/19 LEC 329322/19 DOA (Refiled) 28/10/19 H&W	BCMA Investments Pty Ltd	Class 1 appeal against the deemed refusal for the demolition of building and construction of a new generation boarding house.	Geoff Mossemear	Council served with Class 1 Appeal with matter listed for a section 34 Conciliation Conference on 10 June 2020. Conciliation Conference terminated and matter listed for hearing on 21 and 22 December 2020.	Fee Estimate: \$25,000 Fees: \$12,888.48 Recommendation: N/A Decision: N/A	Pending
66 Shellcove Road, Neutral Bay DA 37/19 LEC 305102/19 DOA 30/09/19 SH	Anne McCusker	Class 1 appeal against the refusal for the subdivision of property into two lots.	Michael Stephens	Council served with Class 1 Appeal with matter listed for a section 34 Conciliation Conference on 27 May 2020. Matter listed for further conciliation on 1 December 2020.	Fee Estimate: \$30,000 Fees: \$26,461.05 Recommendation: Refusal Decision: Refusal	Pending
40 Brightmore Street, Cremorne DA 224/19 LEC 315224/19 DOA 10/10/19 HWL	Connoisseur Investments Pty Ltd	Class 1 appeal against the deemed refusal for the demolition of existing residential flat building and construction of new residential flat building.	George Youhanna	Council served with Class 1 Appeal with matter listed for a section 34 Conciliation Conference on 7 May 2020. Matter listed for hearing on 28 September to 2 October 2020. Appeal discontinued on 21 September 2020. Matter closed.	Fee Estimate: \$90,000 Fees: \$136,973.16 Recommendation: N/A Decision: N/A	Appeal discontinued Matter closed
1/9 Tobruk Ave, Cremorne Order No 1 & 11 LEC 316133/19 DOA 11/10/19 H&W	Richard Bryson	Class 1 appeal against a development control issued regarding unauthorised works to create a dual occupancy within a sole occupancy.	Long Huynh	Council served with Class 1 Appeal with matter listed for a section 34 Conciliation Conference on 23 July 2020. Proceedings adjourned to 23 October 2020.	Fee Estimate: \$20,000 Fees: \$7,643.59 Recommendation: N/A Decision: N/A	Pending

Property DA No. Appeal No. Date of Appeal (DOA)	Applicant/ Other party	Nature of Appeal	Council Officer responsible	Status	Fees Estimate (\$) Fees Billed (\$) Disb. (\$) Officer Recommendation Council decision	Result
13 Shellcove Road, Kurraba Point DA 249/19 LEC 329464/19 DOA 23/10/19 MF	MaryAnn Beregi	Class 1 appeal against the deemed refusal for the alterations and additions to dwelling house including excavation works, double garage, swimming pool and spa, cabana and boat workshop.	Geoff Mossemenear	Council served with Class 1 Appeal with matter listed for hearing on 22 and 23 July 2020. On 5 June 2020 the Applicant made an offer to discontinue the proceedings, subject to each party paying their own costs. Proceedings discontinued with each party to pay their own costs. Matter closed.	Fee Estimate: \$100,000 Fees: \$100,090.34 Recommendation: N/A Decision: N/A	Appeal discontinued Matter closed
24 Cranbrook Avenue. Cremorne DA 175/19 LEC 340894/19 DOA 05/11/19 MDK	Modog Pty Limited	Class 1 appeal against the refusal for the demolition of the existing heritage listed dwelling and construction of a new development and associated landscaping	Luke Donovan	Council served with Class 1 Appeal with the matter listed for hearing on 25 and 26 June 2020. Appeal dismissed on 4 August 2020. Matter closed.	Fee Estimate: \$40,000 Fees: \$103,987.49 Recommendation: Refusal Decision: Refusal	Appeal dismissed Matter closed
27 Edward Street, North Sydney DA 225/19 LEC 354290/19 DOA 12/11/19 H&W	Linda Jays	Class 1 appeal against the deemed refusal for alterations and additions to dwelling including new first floor.	Luke Donovan	Council served with Class 1 Appeal with matter listed for a section 34 Conciliation Conference on 24 July 2020. Section 34 Conference terminated. Amended plans currently on exhibition.	Fee Estimate: \$15,000 Fees: \$8,261.98 Recommendation: N/A Decision: N/A	Pending
116 Blues Point Road, McMahons Point Existing Rights LEC 373973/19 DOA 28/11/19 HWL	Blues Point Hotel Property Pty Ltd and Blues Point Hotel Property No 2 Pty Ltd	Class 4 Summons seeking a declaration that the premise benefits from existing use rights for the purpose of a pub for in its entirety including the first floor external terrace.	Long Huyhn	Council served with Class 4 Summons with the matter listed for hearing on 8,9 and 10 February 2021.	Fee Estimate: \$85,000 Fees: \$66,767.68 Recommendation: N/A Decision: N/A	Pending
111 Milson Road, Cremorne Point DA 289/19 LEC 73040/20 DOA 09/03/20 H&W	Rosetta Stevens	Class 1 appeal against the refusal for the construction of a new double carport within the front set back.	Robyn Pearson	Council served with Class 1 Appeal with matter listed for mention on 27 March 2020. The matter is listed for a s34 Conciliation Conference on 26 and 27 November 2020.	Fee Estimate: \$10,000 Fees: \$3,247.79 Recommendation: Refusal Decision: Refusal	Pending

Property DA No. Appeal No. Date of Appeal (DOA)	Applicant/ Other party	Nature of Appeal	Council Officer responsible	Status	Fees Estimate (\$) Fees Billed (\$) Disb. (\$) Officer Recommendation Council decision	Result
55 Lavender Street, Milsons Point DA 92/05/6 LEC 71383/20 DOA 11/03/20 SH	LDC Opco Holding Company Pty Limited	Class 1 appeal against the deemed refusal to modify the consent to extending the time during which the consent may operate by 15 years.	Luke Donovan	Council served with Class 1 Appeal with matter listed for hearing on 2 and 3 July 2020. Appeal upheld. Matter closed.	Fee Estimate: \$ 35,000 Fees: \$82,154.05 Recommendation: N/A Decision: N/A	Appeal upheld Matter closed
6 John Street, Cremorne Point Order No 11 LEC 122833/20 DOA 24/04/20 HWL	Noakes Group Pty Limited	Class 1 appeal against a development control issued for the operation of Noakes Boatyard not in accordance with the Development Consent 1164/1990.	Long Huynh	Council served with Class 1 Appeal with the matter listed for mediation on 7 August 2020. The parties are currently negotiating a resolution to the proceedings. Further information on this matter will be provided to Councillors as a Confidential Briefing.	Fee Estimate: \$15,000 Fees: \$55,481.29 Recommendation: N/A Decision: N/A	Pending
37-39 Murdoch Street, Cremorne DA 69/20 LEC 157515/20 DOA 23/06/20 MLG	Active Kids Group Pty Limited	Class 1 appeal against the deemed refusal of a first floor addition to existing child care centre – new staff room facilities.	Kim Rothe	Council served with Class 1 Appeal with the matter listed for directions on 7 October 2020.	Fee Estimate: \$15,000 Fees: \$4,264.70 Recommendation: N/A Decision: N/A	Pending
7 Carr Street, Waverton DA 237/19/2 LEC 197275/20 DOA 07/07/20 MLG	David McCrae	Class 1 appeal against the deemed refusal to modify consent No 237/19 with regards to roof form and new skylight.	Hugh Shouldice	Council served with Class 1 Appeal with the matter to be listed for a section 34 Conciliation Conference on 20 and 21 January 2021.	Fee Estimate: TBA Fees: \$0 Recommendation: N/A Decision: N/A	Pending
177-199 Pacific Hwy, North Sydney DA 16//20 LEC 210569/20 DOA 21/07/20 HWL	TPG Telecom Limited (formerly Vodafone Hutchison Australia Pty Limited)	Class 1 appeal against the refusal for illumination of the existing Vodafone sign on the western elevation of the building.	Geoff Mossemear	Council served with Class 1 Appeal with the matter listed for hearing on 8 and 9 March 2021.	Fee Estimate: TBA Fees: \$10,033.65 Recommendation: Refusal Decision: Refusal	Pending
85 Kurraba Road, Kurraba Point General Order LEC 206622/20 DOA 21/07/20 MLG	Proprietors of SP 16183	Class 1 appeal against a development control issued to demolish and remove multi-levelled viewing platform erected in the rear of the yard.	Brad Calleia	Council served with Class 1 Appeal with matter listed for a section 34 Conciliation Conference on 2 October 2020. Proceedings adjourned and section 34 Conciliation Conference to resume 19 October 2020.	Fee Estimate: \$22,550 Fees: \$3,630.00 Recommendation: N/A Decision: N/A	Pending

Property DA No. Appeal No. Date of Appeal (DOA)	Applicant/ Other party	Nature of Appeal	Council Officer responsible	Status	Fees Estimate (\$) Fees Billed (\$) Disb. (\$) Officer Recommendation Council decision	Result
85 Kurraba Road, Kurraba Point C 13/20 LEC 259686/20 DOA 08/09/20 MLG	Proprietors of SP 16183	Class 1 appeal against the refusal of Building Information Certificate No. C13/20 for a multi- levelled viewing platform.	Dane Johnson	Council served with Class 1 Appeal with matter listed for a section 34 Conciliation Conference on 2 October 2020. Proceedings adjourned and section 34 Conciliation Conference to resume 19 October 2020.	Fee Estimate: \$22,550 Fees: \$0 Recommendation: N/A Decision: N/A	Pending

**CURRENT MATTERS LIST
LOCAL COURT MATTERS LIST
As at 30 September 2020**

Property DA No. Appeal No. Date of Appeal (DOA)	Applicant/ Other party	Nature of Appeal	Council Officer responsible	Status	Fees Estimate (\$) Fees Billed (\$) Disb. (\$) Officer Recommendation Council decision	Result
83 Mount Street, North Sydney DOA: 13/06/19 SG	Little Veinna Pty Ltd	Local Court prosecution in respect of a food premises.	Gareth Munro	Proceedings listed for hearing on 23 January 2020. Proceedings discontinued. Matter closed.	Fee Estimate: \$10,000 Fees: \$8,912.75	Matter closed
21 Shellcove Road, Kurraba Point DOA: 31/03/20 SG	Aranac (Contracting) Pty Ltd	Local Court prosecution in respect to development without consent.	Brad Calleia	Court Attendance Notice issued. Awaiting listing date.	Fee Estimate: \$0 Fees: \$0	Pending
Tobruk Avenue, Cremorne DOA: TBA In House with Council Solicitor	Draincorp Pty Ltd	Local Court prosecution in respect to development not in accordance with consent	Mark Ottewill or Catherine Chambers	Annulment application served on 09 March 2020. Overdue fine matter. Listed for mention on 20 October 2020.	Fee Estimate: \$0 Fees: \$0	Pending
Dog Matter DOA: TBA In House with Council Solicitor	Matthew Williams	Local Court prosecution in respect to dog matter (attacks/bites,harasses/ charges)	Patrick Lendvai	Court Attendance Notice received and listed for mention on 19 October 2020. Court elect penalty notice matter.	Fee Estimate: \$0 Fees: \$0	Pending
8 Levick, Cremorne DOA: TBA In House with Council Solicitor	Michael Barnett	Local Court prosecution in respect to development not in accordance with consent	Jose Ferrer	Court Attendance Notice issued and matter listed for mention on 17 November 2020. Court elect penalty notice matter	Fee Estimate: \$0 Fees: \$0	Pending
12 Tobruk Ave, Cremorne DOA: TBA In House with Council Solicitor	Hunter Building Group Pty Ltd	Local Court prosecution in respect to development not in accordance with consent	Mark Ottewill	Court Attendance Notice issued, and matter listed for mention on 20 October 2020. Court elect penalty notice matter	Fee Estimate: \$0 Fees: \$0	Pending

Property DA No. Appeal No. Date of Appeal (DOA)	Applicant/ Other party	Nature of Appeal	Council Officer responsible	Status	Fees Estimate (\$) Fees Billed (\$) Disb. (\$) Officer Recommendation Council decision	Result
Glen St, Milsons Point DOA: 24/9/20 In House with Council Solicitor	Vassil Leon Vasseleou	Local Court prosecution in respect to parking infringement (mobility sticker)	Dayne Foley	Court Attendance Notice received and listed for mention on 6 October 2020. Court elect penalty notice matter.	Fee Estimate: \$0 Fees: \$0	Pending

**NCAT MATTERS LIST
As at 30 September 2020**

Property DA No. Appeal No. Date of Appeal (DOA)	Applicant/ Other party	Nature of Appeal	Council Officer responsible	Status	Fees Estimate (\$) Fees Billed (\$) Disb. (\$) Officer Recommendation Council decision	Result
NCAT Privacy Complaint NCAT: 136495/20 DOA: 14/05/20 MDK	EIG	Request for review of Privacy Complaint	Craig Winn	Council served with NCAT Application with matter listed for hearing on 30 October 2020.	Fee Estimate: \$10,000 Fees: \$20,868.65	Pending
NCAT GIPA Complaint NCAT: 142324/20 DOA: 19/05/20 MDK	Maryann Beregi	Request for review Formal GIPA decision by Council	Craig Winn/Denise Highton	Council served with NCAT Application with matter listed for hearing on 23 June 2020. Proceedings discontinued with each party to pay their own costs. Matter closed.	Fee Estimate: \$10,000 Fees: \$17,093.45	Discontinued Matter closed